

Federal Register Notice: 89 FR 51554, [Federal Register :: Networking and Information Technology Research and Development Request for Information on Digital Twins Research and Development](#), June 18, 2024.

## **Request for Information on the National Digital Twins R&D Strategic Plan**

Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory (LLNL)

DISCLAIMER: Please note that the RFI public responses received and posted do not represent the views or opinions of the U.S. Government. We bear no responsibility for the accuracy, legality, or content of the responses and external links included in this document.



To whom it may concern,

This document is approved for public dissemination. The document contains no business-proprietary or confidential information. Document contents may be reused by the government in the National Digital Twins R&D Strategic Plan and associated documents without attribution.

Herein, Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory (LLNL), provides perspective and insights on digital twin (DT) models, specifically to enable, advance, or accelerate DT usage within the manufacturing technological sector. From our stance as a Department of Energy (DOE) National Nuclear Security Administration (NNSA) Laboratory, LLNL defines manufacturing in the broadest sense, including all types, e.g. conventional (or “subtractive”), additive and 3D printing, industrial and boutique scale, and for all applications, e.g. parts and part assemblies, hardware, chemical, pharmaceutical, and food, national security, etc. When manufacturing is coupled with any or all of sensing, analytics, and modeling as is the case for creating DTs of manufacturing process and/or parts, it is commonly referred to as “advanced manufacturing” (AM). This document uses this terminology for the remainder of the document and thus discusses advanced manufacturing digital twins, or “AM DTs.”

Given the state of global manufacturing, the United States’ competitive edge involves AM technologies that leverages many of the suggested topical areas of this request for information (RFI) . Our RFI response will be organized according to these topical areas. Digital twins represent the culmination of these capacities and, if pursued, will strengthen the US’s industrial sector, economic strength, and technological leadership in AM. Such concepts are frequently discussed by business thought leaders, e.g. McKinsey & Company, Andreessen Horowitz venture capital, etc., and major US manufacturers. Thus, investments in these areas (and digital twins in general) will have long-standing impact in both research and industry AM communities.

***Artificial Intelligence (AI):***

*Integration of Digital Twins with Artificial Intelligence (AI):*

The integration of artificial intelligence (AI) with digital twins represents a transformative approach to advanced manufacturing (AM). By embedding AI algorithms within the digital twin framework, we can enhance the predictive capabilities and operational efficiency of the manufacturing process, leveraging data driven insights from actual AM processes. Furthermore, these AM processes can leverage these techniques with or without underlying physical models. This is because AI can analyze vast amounts of data generated by both the physical and digital twins, identifying patterns and correlations that may not be immediately apparent to human operators. This integration allows for real-time monitoring and adaptive control of the manufacturing process, ensuring that each part meets the required specifications with minimal variation. Furthermore, AI-driven insights can facilitate root cause analysis and error detection, significantly reducing the time and resources required for post-build inspections.





*Leveraging Generative AI for Digital Twin Modeling & Simulation:*

Generative AI offers a powerful tool for enhancing digital twin modeling and simulation. By utilizing generative models, we can create highly accurate and detailed digital representations of the manufacturing process and its outcomes. These models can simulate a wide range of scenarios, including variations in process parameters and environmental conditions, providing valuable insights into the potential performance of the manufactured parts. The ability to generate realistic simulations enables us to predict and mitigate potential issues before they occur, thereby improving the overall quality and reliability of the AM process. Additionally, generative AI can assist in optimizing design parameters, ensuring that the digital twin accurately reflects the intended design and performance characteristics of the physical counterpart.

*Impact of AI on Digital Twins' Physical Counterparts:*

The integration of AI with digital twins has a profound impact on their physical counterparts. By continuously refining the digital twin models through AI-driven data analysis, we can achieve a higher degree of fidelity between the digital and physical representations. This alignment ensures that the virtual inspections and simulations conducted on the digital twins are directly applicable to the physical parts, reducing the need for extensive physical testing and inspection. Moreover, AI can facilitate adaptive control of the manufacturing process, dynamically adjusting parameters to account for real-time variations and ensuring consistent quality. This capability not only accelerates the production process but also enhances the overall reliability and performance of the manufactured parts, ultimately leading to more efficient and cost-effective AM operations.

*AI-Driven Data Analysis for Process Optimization:*

AI-driven data analysis plays a crucial role in optimizing the AM process by leveraging the rich datasets generated by digital twins. Machine learning algorithms can process and analyze data from multiple sources, including sensor readings, process parameters, and inspection results, to identify key factors influencing part quality and performance. This analysis enables the development of predictive models that can forecast potential defects, recommend corrective actions, and accelerate root cause analysis. By incorporating these insights into the digital twin framework, we can implement proactive measures to prevent defects and optimize the manufacturing process. The continuous feedback loop between the physical and digital twins, facilitated by AI, ensures that the process remains adaptive and responsive to changing conditions. For instance, predictive maintenance can ensure AM platforms do not drift from their desired operation regime. Similarly, defective, damaged, or out-of-calibration sensors can be identified by comparisons of the digital twin, which contains insights from production campaigns, against the physical twin.

***Data:***

*Robust Data Engineering Practices:*





To ensure the effectiveness of digital twins in advanced manufacturing, robust data engineering practices are essential. The ability to collect data in real time is paramount, as it allows for immediate analysis and adaptive control of the manufacturing process. This real-time data collection ensures that any deviations from the desired specifications can be promptly identified and corrected, minimizing the risk of defects. Additionally, multi-modality is a critical aspect, as it involves gathering data from various sources and sensors, such as thermal cameras, laser scanners, acoustic sensors, contact-based sensors, etc. This diverse data collection provides a comprehensive view of the manufacturing process, enabling more accurate and holistic digital twin models. Synthetic data generation also may play a vital role, particularly in scenarios where real-world data may be scarce or difficult to obtain. By generating synthetic data, we can augment the existing datasets, enhancing the training and validation of AI models used within the digital twins. Lastly, edge deployments are crucial for processing data at the source, reducing latency and bandwidth requirements. By deploying data processing capabilities at the edge, we can ensure that critical insights and decisions are made swiftly, further enhancing the responsiveness and efficiency of the digital twin framework.

*Governance Methods for Data Collection, Curation, Sharing, and Usage:*

Distinct from data engineering practices, effective governance methods are essential for the successful implementation of digital twins in AM. Establishing clear protocols for data collection ensures that the data gathered is accurate, relevant, and consistent across different stages of the manufacturing process. Curation practices are equally important, as they involve organizing and maintaining the data to ensure its quality and usability over time. Sharing and usage policies must be defined to facilitate collaboration among different stakeholders while protecting sensitive information. By implementing robust governance methods, organizations can ensure that the data used in digital twins is reliable and can be leveraged to its full potential, ultimately enhancing the accuracy and effectiveness of the digital twin models.

*Shared Public Datasets and Repositories:*

The adoption of shared public datasets and repositories can significantly accelerate the development and deployment of digital twins. Public datasets provide a valuable resource to train researchers (in data handling, AI model development, software pipeline construction, etc.), reduce barrier to academic investments in digital twins, and facilitate collaborations. Repositories that host these datasets should adhere to standardized formats and metadata conventions to ensure interoperability and ease of use. Since retrieval and storage of large datasets can be expensive, research in effective compression or creative solutions to data distribution could aid in the increase of public datasets. By encouraging the use of shared public datasets, the digital twin community can foster innovation and collaboration, leading to more advanced and effective solutions for the manufacturing industry. Additionally, public repositories can serve as a benchmark for evaluating the performance of digital twin models, promoting transparency and accountability in the field. It's worth noting data sharing is not always possible or incentivized in classified, export controlled, proprietary, or otherwise





restricted datasets. It is unclear if data obfuscation could offer a method in reducing unwanted data leaks.

*Real-Time Data Integration:*

Real-time data integration is a critical component of effective digital twin implementation. Integrating data from various sources in real time allows for immediate analysis and decision-making, enhancing the responsiveness and adaptability of the manufacturing process. This capability is particularly important for monitoring and controlling complex systems, where delays in data processing can lead to suboptimal performance or even failures. By leveraging real-time data integration, digital twins can provide a dynamic and accurate representation of the physical system, enabling proactive maintenance, optimization, and quality control. Ensuring seamless integration of real-time data requires robust infrastructure and advanced data processing techniques, which are essential for the successful deployment of digital twins. More mature implementation of digital twin systems will take the form of industry-grade software pipelines.

Since digital twins often rely on continuous and multi-modal data sources to provide a comprehensive and dynamic representation of physical systems, developing methodologies and tools for integrating and analyzing these diverse data streams is essential for the effective implementation of digital twins. This includes addressing challenges related to data synchronization, fusion, and real-time processing. By promoting the development of advanced data integration techniques, organizations can ensure that digital twins can leverage the full range of available data, enhancing their accuracy and utility.

*Leveraging Archival Datasets:*

Archival datasets, despite often suffering from bad organization and incomplete information, likely represent a valuable, yet untapped (or untappable!) resource for digital twin development. These datasets contain historical data that can provide insights into long-term trends and patterns, which are crucial for predictive modeling and simulation. To leverage these datasets effectively, research investments are needed for data cleaning and preprocessing techniques to address issues such as missing values, inconsistencies, and noise. Advanced AI and machine learning algorithms can be employed to extract meaningful information from archival datasets, enhancing the accuracy and robustness of digital twin models. By incorporating archival data, digital twins can benefit from a richer and more comprehensive dataset, leading to improved performance and reliability.

***Standards:***

*Ontology and Data Exchange Protocols:*

Developing standardized ontologies and data exchange protocols is crucial for ensuring interoperability and seamless integration of digital twin components. Ontologies provide a structured framework for representing knowledge and relationships within a specific domain, enabling consistent interpretation and communication of data. Data exchange protocols facilitate





the efficient and secure transfer of information between different systems and platforms. By establishing common ontologies and protocols, organizations can ensure that digital twin components can interact and share data effectively, regardless of the underlying technologies. This standardization is key to building scalable and interoperable digital twin solutions that can be easily integrated into existing workflows and systems.

*Encryption Standards:*

Encryption standards are vital for protecting the integrity and confidentiality of data used in digital twin applications. As digital twins often involve the collection and analysis of sensitive information, robust encryption methods are necessary to safeguard against unauthorized access and data breaches. Developing and adopting industry-wide encryption standards ensures that data is securely transmitted and stored, maintaining the trust and confidence of stakeholders. These standards should be regularly updated to address emerging security threats and vulnerabilities, ensuring that digital twin systems remain resilient and secure over time. Research in this area is largely limited to mature and/or commercial digital twin systems; however, solutions can be derived from academic groups as well with targeting funding calls.

*Evaluation of Data-Driven Digital Twin Components:*

Evaluating the performance and reliability of data-driven digital twin components is a critical challenge that requires the development of robust methodologies and tools. These evaluation methods should consider various factors, such as accuracy, scalability, and robustness, to ensure that digital twin models can effectively represent and predict the behavior of physical systems. By establishing standardized evaluation criteria and benchmarks, organizations can systematically assess the quality and performance of digital twin components, facilitating continuous improvement and innovation. This rigorous evaluation process is essential for building trust and confidence in digital twin technologies.

***Verification, Validation, and Uncertainty Quantification (VVUQ):***

*Foundational and Cross-Cutting Methods:*

Developing foundational and cross-cutting methods for Verification, Validation, and Uncertainty Quantification (VVUQ) is essential for ensuring the reliability and accuracy of digital twins. Foundational methods provide the basic principles and frameworks that can be applied across various domains, ensuring a consistent approach to VVUQ. Cross-cutting methods, on the other hand, address the common challenges and requirements that span multiple applications and industries. By establishing these core methodologies, organizations can create a robust foundation for VVUQ that supports the development of high-quality digital twin models. These methods should be adaptable and scalable, allowing them to be applied to different types of digital twins and evolving as the technology advances.

*Integration of VVUQ into the Full Digital Twin Ecosystem:*





Integrating VVUQ into all elements of the full digital twin ecosystem is critical for maintaining the integrity and trustworthiness of digital twin models throughout their lifecycle. This integration involves embedding VVUQ processes into the design, development, deployment, and maintenance stages of digital twins. By incorporating VVUQ from the outset, organizations can identify and address potential issues early, ensuring that digital twins are built on a solid foundation of verified and validated data. Continuous VVUQ practices during the operational phase help monitor and maintain the performance of digital twins, adapting to changes and uncertainties in real-time. This holistic approach ensures that VVUQ is not an afterthought but a fundamental component of the digital twin ecosystem.

Sincerely,

Brian Giera, PhD  
Director, Data Science Institute  
Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory

